



# MID TERM EVALUATION OF THE SOUTHERN & EASTERN REGIONAL OPERATIONAL PROGRAMME 2014-20

Appendix 4 – Project Selection – Transparency of procedures FINAL

May 2019

# Contents

1.	APPENDIX 4A: TRANSPARENCY OF PROJECT SELECTION PROCEDURES	4
2.	APPENDIX 4B: PROJECT SELECTION - PRIORITY/SCHEME OBJECTIVE INCORPORATED INTO THE PROJECT SELECTION SYSTEM.....	14
2.1	PRIORITY 1 - STRENGTHENING RESEARCH, TECHNOLOGY DEVELOPMENT AND INNOVATION.....	14
2.1.1	SFI Research Centres Programme.....	14
2.1.2	SFI Spokes Programme .....	16
2.1.3	Marine Research Programme.....	18
2.1.4	Commercialisation Fund .....	19
2.1.5	Innovation Partnership Programme .....	20
2.2	PRIORITY 2 - ENHANCING ACCESS TO, AND USE AND QUALITY OF ICT	21
2.2.1	National Broadband Plan.....	21
2.3	PRIORITY 3 - ENHANCING THE COMPETITIVENESS OF SMES .....	22
2.3.1	Entrepreneurship in Micro-Enterprises .....	22
2.4	PRIORITY 4 - SUPPORTING THE SHIFT TOWARDS A LOW-CARBON ECONOMY	23
2.4.1	Social Housing Retrofit .....	23
2.4.2	Better Energy Warmer Home Schemes.....	24
2.5	PRIORITY 5 - SUSTAINABLE URBAN DEVELOPMENT .....	26
2.5.1	Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme .....	26
2.5.2	Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme – Details of Planned Developments and Relevance to Priority .....	27
3.	APPENDIX 4C: PROJECT SELECTION - EXTENT TO WHICH PROJECT SELECTION PROCESS IS COMPETITIVE IN NATURE.....	29
3.1	PRIORITY 1 - STRENGTHENING RESEARCH, TECHNOLOGY DEVELOPMENT AND INNOVATION.....	29
3.1.1	SFI Research Centres Programme.....	29
3.1.2	SFI Spokes Programme .....	30
3.1.3	Marine Research Programme.....	30
3.1.4	Commercialisation Fund .....	30
3.1.5	Innovation Partnership Programme .....	31
3.2	PRIORITY 2 - ENHANCING ACCESS TO, AND USE AND QUALITY OF ICT	31
3.2.1	National Broadband Plan.....	31
3.3	PRIORITY 3 - ENHANCING THE COMPETITIVENESS OF SMES .....	32
3.3.1	Entrepreneurship in Micro-Enterprise .....	32
3.4	PRIORITY 4 - SUPPORTING THE SHIFT TOWARDS A LOW-CARBON ECONOMY	32

3.4.1	Social Housing Retrofit .....	32
3.4.2	Better Energy Warmer Homes Scheme.....	33
3.5	PRIORITY 5 - SUSTAINABLE URBAN DEVELOPMENT .....	33
3.5.1	Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme .....	33

# 1. APPENDIX 4A: TRANSPARENCY OF PROJECT SELECTION PROCEDURES

The table below details the selection process, eligibility criteria and appeals process for all schemes.

**Table 1: Scheme level analysis of Selection process, eligibility and appeals**

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
<b>1 - Strengthening Research, Technology Development and Innovation</b>	SFI Research Centres Programme <sup>1</sup>	<p>Involves 3 stages:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Pre-Proposal stage</li> <li>• Full Proposal stage</li> <li>• Impact Panel Presentation.</li> </ul> <p>A full description of each stage and a clear explanation of the application process is detailed in a call for submission of proposals documents that is readily available to applicants on the SFI Research Centres Programme website.</p> <p>Each pre-proposal is reviewed by a panel of scientific and commercialisation experts who evaluate its scientific merit and its potential to deliver significant economic and societal impact.<sup>2</sup></p>	<p>Applicant groups must have one lead applicant and between two and nine co-applicants. The Applicant/Co-Applciant must:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• have a PhD or equivalent;</li> <li>• be at least five years post the year of conferring of this qualification by the proposal deadline (i.e., the year on the certificate must be 2013 or earlier);</li> <li>• be a senior author on at least 5 international peer reviewed articles;</li> <li>• hold an independent research grant;</li> </ul> <p>Applicants must be members of an academic institution of an eligible Research Body.</p>	<p>The appeal process at SFI has three stages:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Explanation by the SFI programme manager or scientific director</li> <li>• Review of the appeal by an SFI director not involved in the original review</li> <li>• Further review by the Director General at the request of the host research body</li> </ul> <p>There is no indication that unsuccessful applicants are made aware of the process- however the information is readily available to applicants on the SFI website.</p>
	SFI Spokes Programme <sup>3</sup>	<p>There are two programmes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Spokes Fixed Programme</li> </ul>	<p>Eligibility is defined below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Applicant must be member of an academic institution of an eligible</li> </ul>	

<sup>1</sup> S&E ROP Implementation Plan, P1,pg 11

<sup>2</sup> <http://www.sfi.ie/funding/funding-calls/sfi-research-centres/24-research-centres-call-doc-2016.pdf>

<sup>3</sup> S&E ROP Implementation Plan, P1,pg 1

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Spokes Rolling Programme</li> </ul> <p>The review process takes place in the following stages:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Postal Review</li> <li>Full Proposal Panel Review</li> </ul>	<p>Research Body or</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A contract researcher with a contract that covers the period of the grant or</li> <li>An individual who will be recognised by the Research Body upon receipt of the SFI grant</li> </ul>	
	Marine Research Programme <sup>4</sup>	<p>Administered via competitive calls for proposals from both the research community and industry. Research proposals are evaluated by a panel of national and international experts maintained by the Marine Institute and drawn from third-level, public and industry sectors, to ensure that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Eligibility Check: To ensure comply with eligibility rules</b></li> <li><b>Individual Expert Evaluation: Evaluated against pre-defined evaluation criteria</b></li> <li><b>Consensus Evaluation: Evaluators agree consensus scores</b></li> <li><b>Final Project Confirmation: Based on</b></li> </ul>	<p>Eligibility is defined below:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Applications are invited from the island of Ireland with the appropriate scientific and technical qualifications and research expertise.</li> <li>A partnership approach between institutions (higher education institute, research institute or other public body) and industry is permissible, through its competitive calls for proposals.</li> <li>The lead institution must be a public body.</li> <li>SMEs may participate as a project partner or a sub-contractor.</li> </ul>	<p>The Marine Institute does not have a formal appeals process. Recognised experts are used to evaluate proposals in order to ensure that best research proposals are selected for funding.</p>

<sup>4</sup> S&E ROP Implementation Plan, P1,pg 31

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
		<p><b>ranking by expert panel and available funding</b></p> <p><b>Selection Panel</b></p> <p>A panel of national/international experts established by the Marine Institute's Research. Funding Office will evaluate eligible proposals. All reasonable measures will be taken to ensure objectivity, fairness, quality and confidentiality. <sup>5</sup></p> <p><b>Marking Criteria</b></p> <p>A full description of the marking criteria used is provided in an "Application Guidelines" document. This breaks down the value added to each section of the report in the evaluation of applications.</p>		
	Commercialisation Fund <sup>6</sup>	<p>Involves three stages:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Application process: Applications from researchers for Commercialisation Fund supports will be evaluated for their commercial and if appropriate to the support</li> </ul>	<p>All researchers in the third-level sector and non-profit research agencies and organisations in the Republic of Ireland including staff on contract can apply.</p> <p>An open call programme operates, and applications can be submitted at any time to the programme.</p> <p>Before commencing the application on-</p>	<p>Enterprise Ireland's procedure for dealing with appeals is as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clients have the right to contact their DA to discuss committee decisions.</li> <li>• Clients have the right to appeal to the Secretary to the Board.</li> </ul>

<sup>5</sup> <https://www.marine.ie/Home/sites/default/files/MIFiles/Docs/ResearchFunding/Guidelines%20for%20Applicants%20Industry-Led%20Awards%202018.pdf>

<sup>6</sup> S&E ROP Implementation Plan, P1,pg 20

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
		<p>technical merit by internal and/or external evaluators.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Projects are assessed for their commercial merit and technical merit by internal and in some cases external reviewers and panels which may include external experts.</li> <li>Evaluation process: select projects for funding that best meet the objectives of the Fund.</li> </ul> <p><b>Information available for Applicants:</b> The programme provides a detailed frequently asked questions document for prospective applicants.</p> <p>A reference document is also accessible to applicants that details a 5-point evaluation criteria (Innovation and Technology Development, Commercial Opportunity, Exploitation and Economic Impact, Project team, Workplan and Management, Project Costs). Both the FAQ and reference documents are available on the Enterprise Ireland website.</p>	<p>line, applicants must consult a Technology Transfer office case manager or equivalent and an Enterprise Ireland Commercialisation Specialist and they must agree to be advisors on the application.</p> <p>The Commercial Case Feasibility Support will fund 3 month projects and will not support Masters or Ph.D students.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Clients can re-apply as often as they wish.</li> </ul>
	Innovation Partnership	The review process includes the following stages:	The company must be a registered client of one of the following state development agencies: Enterprise Ireland, IDA Ireland,	

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
	Programme <sup>7</sup>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Commercial opportunity</li> <li>• Exploitation potential (Economic Impact in Ireland)</li> <li>• Innovation</li> <li>• Project team</li> <li>• Project Management and Workplan</li> <li>• Project Costs</li> </ul> <p><b>Information for Applicants:</b></p> <p>Enterprise Ireland have published a detailed guidelines document to applicants, which clearly describes each stage of the application process. However there does not appear to be specific information regarding members of the evaluation team and how applications are specifically scored.</p>	<p>Local Enterprise Office, Údarás na Gaeltachta.</p> <p>The company must have the full support of their assigned Development Adviser/Agency Contact to participate in the programme.</p> <p>The research fund must be spent within Ireland and the economic impact in Ireland must justify the research investment.</p> <p>Sectors, can include, manufacturing, processing and research companies dealing with science, engineering and technology.<sup>8</sup></p> <p>Furthermore, all internationally tradable goods and services companies (financial, tourism etc.) are also eligible to participate.</p>	
<b>2 - Enhancing access to, and use and quality of ICT</b>	National Broadband Plan <sup>9</sup>	<p>The <b>areas targeted for the provision</b> of broadband service were planned to be identified in a comprehensive mapping exercise.</p> <p>The <b>broadband service provider</b> will be selected using a competitive tender process.</p>	<p>Household and business with a broadband speed lower than 30Mbps. There is also a particular focus on urban centres who often can only access 1Mbps or 2Mbps.</p> <p>The Department of Communications, Climate Action and Environment (DCCAE) outlined in Q2 2018 that 540,574 premises</p>	All prospective service providers who are unsuccessful in the tender process have the option to exercise their rights to appeal under the terms of <i>Directive 2007/66/EC</i> .

<sup>7</sup> S&E ROP Implementation Plan, P1,pg 25

<sup>8</sup> Innovation Partnership Programme, FAQs 2018.

<sup>9</sup> S&E ROP 2014-2020 (2)



Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
			<p>were within their planned intervention area. These premises span across all counties in Ireland and represents 22.8% of the total number of premises in Ireland. The plan also aims to targets specific rural areas without access to broadband.<sup>10</sup></p> <p>The scheme aims to stimulate regional development, growth and retention in jobs while enabling e-farming, e-health, trading online, e-education, and tourism.</p>	
<b>3 - Enhancing the competitiveness of SMEs</b>	Entrepreneurship in Micro Enterprise <sup>11</sup>	<p>The approval process will pursue a systematic appraisal of all project proposals. The selection process follows specific key selection criteria based on national guidelines and include the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The quality, commercial viability of the project proposal and its local relevance</li> <li>• Overall costs of the project and its cost effectiveness</li> <li>• The contribution of the proposal to the development of the enterprise in terms of internal capacity</li> <li>• Potential for deadweight or</li> </ul>	<p><b>IBYE:</b> National competition targeting young entrepreneurs between the ages of 18 to 35</p> <p><b>Start-Your-Own-Business Programmes:</b> targeted at the unemployed to encourage them to develop their skills in addition to presenting self employment as a career development option.</p> <p>The interventions aim to target the capability of owner/managers of micro-businesses, the unemployed and young entrepreneurs through training and development actions including mentoring programmes, peer learning's and access to business networks, with a particular focus on high growth and potential high growth enterprises.</p> <p>There are no defined sectors, supports may be targeted at more value-added</p>	Appeals are dealt with at LEO/Local Authority level as per the customer charter.

<sup>10</sup> <https://www.dccae.gov.ie/documents/County%20Statistics%20Q2%202018.pdf>

<sup>11</sup> S&E ROP (3), pp. 4-5

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
		<p>displacement</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Potential to increase the competitiveness of the enterprise and added value to local enterprise development</li> <li>Adherence to cross cutting themes.<sup>12</sup></li> </ul> <p>The LEOs throughout the S&amp;E region have adopted a number of actions to ensure that there is equality of opportunity for all groups:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>LEO South Dublin</b> encourages applications from non-Irish nationals and other groups, including travellers and older persons. They also highlighted an Awareness programme for LEO staff on how to encourage non-Irish nationals and travellers applicants and how to deal effectively with their needs in the application process.</li> <li><b>LEO South Dublin</b> encourages people of any gender, ethnic</li> </ul>	<p>clients in the manufacturing and traded services activities</p> <p>Targeting: business start-ups Entrepreneurs /Self-employed persons, Employment in micro enterprises seeking support for increase employment levels and higher innovation levels in micro-enterprises.</p> <p>The research fund must be spent within Ireland and the economic impact in Ireland must justify the research investment.</p>	

<sup>12</sup> S&E ROP Implementation Plan (P3)

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
		<p>background, and any age to approach the LEO with their business ideas and plans.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>LEO Cork</b> operate a support network female group.</li> <li>• <b>LEO Wicklow</b> have specific programmes in place that target female entrepreneurs</li> <li>• <b>LEO Tipperary</b> gender proof all initiatives.</li> </ul>		
<b>4 - Supporting the shift towards a low-carbon economy</b>	Better Energy Warmer Homes <sup>13</sup>	<p>The Warmer Homes process begins with an application form and the full process is expected to take up to nine months. The two main stages of application are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Application form submission</li> <li>• Survey of property's suitability for support against criteria.</li> </ul> <p><b>Information for Applicants:</b> A detailed description is available on the citizens information website that provides information to applicants on the eligibility requirements and how/where to</p>	<p>Applicants must satisfy eligibility criteria to qualify for this support. These criteria include the requirement for ownership of a home in Ireland that was built before 1 January 2006. Applicants must also be in receipt of one of a number of welfare payments. Among these rules contain eligibility requirements that specifically refer to disadvantaged groups (applicants in receipt of welfare payments) - including fuel allowance, job seekers allowance, working family payment, one-parent family payment, domiciliary care allowance and carers allowance living with the person they are caring for.<sup>15</sup></p> <p>Households are individually (and independently) surveyed to assess what</p>	<p>Complaints to SEAI should be directed to the Customer Service Team. Each applicant applying to participate in the Scheme agrees to adhere to the SEAI complaint and appeals procedure as set out in the customer charter section of the SEAI website.</p>

<sup>13</sup> S&E Regional OP 2014 –2020 Priority 4 pg 6 -12

<sup>15</sup> S&E Regional OP 2014-2020

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
		apply <sup>14</sup> .	measures are appropriate. Applications are then batched, generally on a geographical basis and allocated to individual contractors. <sup>16</sup>	
	Social Housing Retrofit <sup>17</sup>	Selection of properties is based on the results of a conditional thermal efficiency survey of the housing units.	<p>It is the responsibility of the Local Authorities to identify properties in need, which will:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Have a minimum wall and attic insulation of 300mm</li> <li>• Have un-insulated solid walls</li> <li>• Solid block housing</li> <li>• Hollow block or mass concrete wall (u-Value 2.1)</li> </ul> <p>The service provider (or 'Project Owner') will coordinate a minimum of five homes for an application and will advise if there is a suitable bundle that your home can be included in.</p>	In the case of a dispute or an appeal regarding the eligibility it will be referred to the Department of Housing, Planning, Community & Local Government.
<b>5 Sustainable Urban Development</b>	Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme <sup>18</sup>	Local authorities are invited to submit projects which fit with their integrated strategies to tackle the social, economic, environmental, climate and demographic challenges affecting the urban centres. Clear guidelines will be provided to the local authorities with the calls for proposals to ensure that the selected actions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Social and Economic benefits that the proposal will bring to the community and to the urban centre concerned over-and-above what is there already in terms of employment and sustainable economic development.</li> <li>• Value for money of the proposed actions to be supported and the</li> </ul>	Local Authorities will be given an opportunity to re-apply to the Steering Committee for funding in instances where they are dissatisfied with a grant award decision, setting out the basis for their request for re-consideration of the decision

<sup>14</sup> [http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/housing/housing\\_grants\\_and\\_schemes/warmer\\_homes\\_scheme.html](http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/housing/housing_grants_and_schemes/warmer_homes_scheme.html)

<sup>16</sup> S&E Regional OP 2014-2020

<sup>17</sup> S&E Regional OP 2014 – 2020 Priority 4 pg. 6 -12

<sup>18</sup> S&E Regional OP 2014 – 2020 Priority 5 pg 1 -6

Priority	Scheme	Selection Process and Criteria	Eligibility Criteria	Appeals Process
		meet the required standards and target the appropriate challenges in selected urban areas	<p>expected leverage effect of additional public and private funding</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Inclusiveness of the consultative process undertaken in the development of the integrated strategy and the prioritization of project actions, in terms of council and community buy-in.</li> <li>• Delivery arrangement including project management arrangements, milestones, targets, deadlines and outcomes.</li> <li>• included within the scheme's assessment criteria is that the quality of the selected proposal will be assessed in terms of their <b>social inclusion</b><sup>19</sup></li> </ul>	

<sup>19</sup> [https://www.maynoothuniversity.ie/sites/default/files/assets/document/SBlairPresentation%20-%20Sustainable%20Urban%20Development%20for%20URBACT%20seminar\\_0.pdf](https://www.maynoothuniversity.ie/sites/default/files/assets/document/SBlairPresentation%20-%20Sustainable%20Urban%20Development%20for%20URBACT%20seminar_0.pdf)

## 2. APPENDIX 4B: PROJECT SELECTION - PRIORITY/SCHEME OBJECTIVE INCORPORATED INTO THE PROJECT SELECTION SYSTEM

This section assesses whether priority / scheme objectives are incorporated into the project selection basis. This is presented for all schemes by priority.

Note: Priority Objectives are included in Appendix 1C: Intervention Logic: in this section the scheme objectives are included.

### 2.1 Priority 1 - Strengthening Research, Technology Development and Innovation

#### 2.1.1 SFI Research Centres Programme

##### Objective

The Research Centres Programme has a number of objectives which directly relate to the need to establish industry partnerships. In particular<sup>20</sup>:

- To increase the level of industrial and commercial investment in R&D activities with existing Ireland-based companies, and furthermore to attract large Foreign Direct Investments in corporate R&D laboratories;
- To spin out new, high-technology start-up companies that have the potential to raise external angel or venture funding;
- To transfer technology, through licenses, to Multinational Companies (MNCs) and Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) based in Ireland;
- To transfer knowledge, expertise and know-how to MNCs and SMEs based in Ireland; and
- To undertake joint research projects with industry.

The Research Centres eligible for ERDF funding in the 2014 – 2020 Operational Programme were awarded funding following the 2013 Research Centres Call. This Call operated on a themed basis and focused on a number of areas which could generate significant economic and societal benefit for Ireland. The themes that were selected were aligned to National Research Prioritisation (NRP) areas identified by the National Research Prioritisation Exercise which was implemented as government policy in 2012. The themes for the 2013 SFI Research Centres Call were:

- Future Networks and Communications (Priority Area A)
- Digital Platforms, Content and Applications (Priority Area C)
- Medical Devices (Priority Area E)
- Diagnostics (Priority Area F)
- Sustainable Food Production and Processing (Priority Area I)
- Smart Grids and Smart Cities (Priority Area K)
- Manufacturing Competitiveness (Priority Area L)
- Software (Platform science & technology)
- Geosciences Underpinning Sustainable Economic Development
- Earth and Ocean Observation

<sup>20</sup> <https://www.sfi.ie/research-news/publications/organisational-publications/SFI-Research-Centres-Interim-Evaluation-Indecon-Report.pdf>

In addition to the requirement for scientific excellence, applications considered under the 2013 SFI Research Centres Call needed to clearly demonstrate potential for economic and societal impact to Ireland, and this was required at both pre-proposal and full proposal stages.

### Evaluation Criteria

To ensure that the priority objectives are incorporated into the project selection system, the table below details the evaluation criteria for the SFI Research Centres Programme which are rated on a score of (0-5). It also includes details of the objectives that the evaluation criteria link to.

**Table 2: Evaluation Criteria for SFI Research Centres Programme<sup>21</sup>**

Evaluation Criteria	Description	Relevant Objectives <sup>22</sup>
<b>Team</b>	Quality, significance, and relevance of the recent research record of the lead and co-applicants and the strength and cohesiveness of the applicant group, including likely synergy in delivering research and potential for international leadership	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>To undertake joint research projects with industry.</li> <li>To inspire the future generation of STEM students and train and educate a cohort of engineers and scientists at MSc/MEng/PhD and post-doctoral level that will take up high value employment in MNCs and SMEs based in Ireland.</li> </ul>
<b>Science</b>	Quality, significance, and relevance of the proposed research, including value for money and the potential to advance knowledge and understanding within its own field or across different fields	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>To achieve, maintain and enhance research excellence and leadership, as measured through indicators such as publication in top-tier journals and conferences, citations, editorship of top-tier journals and giving invited lectures at top-tier conferences.</li> </ul>
<b>Potential for impact</b>	Quality, significance, and relevance of the proposed research's potential contribution to demonstrably support and underpin enterprise competitiveness and societal development in Ireland	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>To deliver significant economic and societal impact</li> <li>To increase the level of industrial and commercial investment in R&amp;D activities with existing Ireland-based companies, and furthermore to attract large Foreign Direct Investments in corporate R&amp;D laboratories;</li> <li>To transfer knowledge, expertise and know-how to MNCs and SMEs based in Ireland;</li> <li>To attract additional non-Exchequer funding through</li> </ul>

<sup>21</sup> Source: SFI Research Centres Programme 2013. <https://rio.jrc.ec.europa.eu/en/file/7858/download?token=lcDh2lhF>

<sup>22</sup> <https://www.sfi.ie/research-news/publications/organisational-publications/SFI-Research-Centres-Interim-Evaluation-Indecon-Report.pdf>

See also <https://rio.jrc.ec.europa.eu/en/file/7858/download?token=lcDh2lhF>

Evaluation Criteria	Description	Relevant Objectives <sup>22</sup>
		industry sources and external research funding organisations. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To engage the general public and equip them with the tools to confidently understand and debate science, technology and engineering research in Ireland.</li> </ul>
<b>Execution &amp; Delivery</b>	Quality of plans for execution and delivery of the research programme and Centre goals, including the appropriateness of the proposed milestones and deliverables (specific to evaluation of full proposal applications)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To spin out new, high-technology start-up companies that have the potential to raise external angel or venture funding;</li> <li>• To transfer technology, through licenses, to Multinational Companies (MNCs) and Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) based in Ireland;</li> </ul>

### Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives

In summary, the above evaluation criteria align with all defined objectives within this scheme.

## 2.1.2 SFI Spokes Programme

### Objectives

The Research Centres Programme has a number of objectives which directly relate to the need to establish industry partnerships. In particular:

- Increase the number of targeted projects
- Build new capabilities into an SFI Research Centre
- Mechanism to allow new industry or academic partners to join the consortium
- Mechanism to incentivise the commencement of new projects with existing industry partners
- Encourage clusters of SMEs to join the consortium that individually may not otherwise have the financial means to do so
- Link existing Centres and other major Grant Holders and build an integrated, efficient and coherent Research Centre ecosystem
- Allow the Research Centre to develop and evolve dynamically and thereby enhance its sustainability

Like the SFI Research Centres, the SFI Spokes programme will help link scientists and engineers in partnerships across academia and industry to address crucial research questions, foster the development of new and existing Irish-based technology companies, attract industry that could make an important contribution to Ireland and its economy, and expand educational and career opportunities in Ireland in science and engineering.

The specific objectives of the Research Centres programme are relevant to the Spokes programme, since all Spokes awards will become part of the centre in its entirety. Spokes proposals may be new projects with industry partners with whom the SFI Research Centre already has a commercial relationship, or they may be new projects with new industry partners with whom the SFI Research Centre has never worked previously.



SFI Spokes projects must exhibit outstanding research quality, intellectual rigour, and active collaboration and add value to the current objectives of the SFI Research Centre.

The Spokes Programme will contribute to the specific objective of the investment priority by enabling new industrial and academic partners to join existing strategic research projects. This will increase the level of strategic research activity in the region and enable increased engagement by industry with the supported research centres.

### Evaluation Criteria

To ensure that the priority objectives are incorporated into the project selection system, the table below details the evaluation criteria for the SFI Spokes Programme (Postal Review Process) which are rated on a score of (1-5). It also includes details of the objectives that the evaluation criteria link to.

**Table 3: Evaluation Criteria for SFI Spokes Programme<sup>23</sup>**

Evaluation Criteria	Description	Relevant Objectives <sup>24</sup>
<b>Science</b>	Quality, significance, and relevance of the proposed research, including value for money and the potential to advance knowledge and understanding within its own field or across different fields	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Build new capabilities into an SFI Research Centre</li> <li>• Link existing Centres and other major Grant Holders and build an integrated, efficient and coherent Research Centre ecosystem</li> </ul>
<b>Alignment</b>	Alignment/value add of the proposed project(s) with the current objectives of the SFI Research Centre	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Link existing Centres and other major Grant Holders and build an integrated, efficient and coherent Research Centre ecosystem</li> <li>• Allow the Research Centre to develop and evolve dynamically and thereby enhance its sustainability</li> </ul>
<b>Team</b>	Quality, significance, and relevance of the recent research record of the proposed investigator(s), taking into account the career stage of the applicant(s), and the applicant's record of securing non-exchequer funding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mechanism to allow new industry or academic partners to join the consortium</li> <li>• Mechanism to incentivise the commencement of new projects with existing industry partners</li> </ul>
<b>Potential for Impact</b>	Quality, significance, and relevance of the proposed research's potential contribution to demonstrably support and underpin enterprise competitiveness and societal development in Ireland	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Increase the number of targeted projects</li> <li>• Encourage clusters of SMEs to join the consortium that individually may not otherwise have the financial means to do so</li> </ul>

<sup>23</sup> S&E ROP Scheme Implementation Plan (January 2018)

<sup>24</sup> Source: IBEC,

<http://www.nhfireland.ie/IBEC/DFB.nsf/04B82D9CA083E2F680257BEB0052CB40/B70BC1618EEEC4D18025797B00542CC6>

## Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives

In summary, all of the above evaluation criteria relate to the objectives proposed within this scheme.

### 2.1.3 Marine Research Programme

#### Objectives

The objective of the Marine Research Programme is to provide funding to the marine sector in Ireland that will:

- Build new research capacity and capability;
- Enable sharing of existing knowledge and technology transfer;
- Increase competitiveness and opportunities for sustainable economic growth;
- Protect and conserve marine resources;
- Inform public policy; and
- Increase public awareness of our maritime heritage<sup>25</sup>

The successful application will include sufficient research and scientific staffing to meet the research objectives listed below:

- Maintain & expand the marine biodiscovery repositories (freeze-dried marine algal, invertebrate and sediment samples as well as marine-derived microbial cultures, solvent-extracted samples in various formats such as 96 deep well plate, vials, etcetera).
- Liaise with local management in the Marine Institute on the running of the laboratory and a small budget (From the Term of Reference of the Marine Research Programme Annex 1, Point 4 - Operating Budget: An operating budget of €40,000 per annum is available for consumable and the maintenance of Marine Institute owned equipment).
- Maintain electronic database tracking samples processed through bioassays performed, results and isolated bioactive molecules.
- Conduct research in the area of marine natural products (e.g. small molecule, peptides, proteins, enzymes).
- Build relationships and liaise with the Marine Institute and other Research Performers and Funders (e.g. SFI).
- Actively stimulate and participate in research collaborations nationally and internationally and be proactive in research proposal writing.
- Actively promote the marine biorepository and laboratory nationally and internationally.
- Actively engage with Industry – both small -medium sized enterprises and multinationals<sup>26</sup>.

#### Evaluation Criteria

The table below details the evaluation criteria for the Marine Research Programme. It also includes details of the objectives that the evaluation criteria link to.

---

**Table 4: Evaluation Criteria for Marine Research Programme**

---

<sup>25</sup> [www.southernassembly.ie/eu-programmes/southern-and-eastern-regional-operational-programme-2014-2020](http://www.southernassembly.ie/eu-programmes/southern-and-eastern-regional-operational-programme-2014-2020)

<sup>26</sup> <http://www.marine.ie/Home/sites/default/files/MIFiles/Docs/ResearchFunding/Marine%20Bioresources%20Call%202016%20Terms%20of%20Reference.pdf>

Evaluation Criteria <sup>27</sup>	Description	Relevant Objectives
<b>Science</b>	Build new research capacity and capability;	Conduct research in the area of marine natural products (e.g. small molecule, peptides, proteins, enzymes).
<b>Team</b>	Enable sharing of existing knowledge and technology transfer;	Liaise with local management in the Marine Institute on the running of the laboratory  Build relationships and liaise with the Marine Institute and other Research Performers and Funders (e.g. SFI).
<b>Alignment</b>	Increase competitiveness and opportunities for sustainable economic growth;	Actively stimulate and participate in research collaborations nationally and internationally and be proactive in research proposal writing.  Maintain electronic database tracking samples processed through bioassays performed, results and isolated bioactive molecules.
<b>Impact</b>	Increase public awareness of our maritime heritage.  Inform public policy	Actively promote the marine biorepository and laboratory nationally and internationally.  Actively engage with Industry – both small -medium sized enterprises and multinationals
<b>Environment</b>	Protect and conserve marine resources;	Maintain & expand the marine biodiscovery repositories (freeze-dried marine algal, invertebrate and sediment samples as well as marine-derived microbial cultures, solvent-extracted samples in various formats such as 96 deep well plate, vials, etcetera).

### Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives

In summary, all of the above evaluation criteria relate to the objectives proposed within this scheme.

## 2.1.4 Commercialisation Fund

### Objectives:

The aim of the Commercialisation Fund is to improve the competitiveness of the Irish economy through the creation of technology-based start-up companies and the transfer of innovations developed in 3rd level institutions to Irish industry. The programme will fund the development of innovations at all stages of the commercial pipeline to the point where the innovations can be commercialised as new products, services and companies.

The Commercialisation Fund will contribute to the specific objective of the investment priority by supporting research organisations to develop a route to commercialisation for innovative technology-based projects, leading to the creation of R&D based spin-out enterprises. This is ensured by evaluation criteria presented in the table below.<sup>28</sup>

### Evaluation Criteria

<sup>27</sup> <http://www.marine.ie/Home/sites/default/files/MIFiles/Docs/ResearchFunding/Marine%20Bioresources%20Call%202016%20Terms%20of%20Reference.pdf>

<sup>28</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020. P1, pg 22

Proposals will be evaluated by a minimum of two evaluators including at least one relevant external reviewer. The evaluation assesses a number of criteria, as detailed in the table below.. It also includes details of the objectives that the evaluation criteria link to.

**Table 5: Evaluation Criteria for Commercialisation Fund** <sup>29</sup>

Evaluation Criteria	Description	Relevant Objectives
<b>Commercial opportunity</b>	Commercial Opportunity - Size of the opportunity and validation of the market	Relevance of the tasks of the feasibility project to the development of the commercial case
<b>Exploitation potential (Economic Impact in Ireland)</b>	Exploitation and Economic Impact - Opportunity for Ireland and route to exploitation	Engage with customers, end-users, Industries and other relevant stakeholders particularly focusing on developing the exploitation route in Ireland
<b>Innovation</b>	Innovation and Technology Development - Level of Innovation and technical Feasibility	Perform primary and secondary market analysis to identify the commercial opportunities for the innovation
<b>Project team</b>	Project team, Workplan and Management and skills and resources	Provide a team with relevant skills and sufficient resources to successfully carry out the project
<b>Project Management and Workplan</b>	Project plan and deliverables	Provide clearly described feasible, technical and commercial workplans
<b>Project Costs</b>	Value for money	Provide realistic and appropriate project outputs, which adequately justified for each category and project stage

### Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives

In summary, all of the above evaluation criteria relate to the objectives proposed within this scheme.

## 2.1.5 Innovation Partnership Programme

### Objectives<sup>30</sup>

The objective of the Innovation Partnership Programme is to propel the use of key technologies by Irish companies by encouraging them to work with Irish research institutes, resulting in mutually beneficial co-operation and interaction.

Companies can access expertise and resources to develop new and improved products, processes, services, and generate new knowledge and know-how. The participating company benefits in terms of its growth, the evolution of its strategic research and development and the creation of new knowledge that it can use to generate commercial advantage. The research institute benefits in terms of developing skill sets, intellectual property and publications. The Innovation Partnership programme leverages the research strengths and technical expertise in Irish HEIs to develop innovations that will have an economic impact in Ireland. The Innovation Partnership programme is aligned to 14 areas of the Research Prioritisation Exercise.

The Innovation Partnership Programme helps companies to engage in collaborative research projects with Irish universities and institutes of technology to develop new products and services. The Programme will

<sup>29</sup> EI Commercialisation Fund Programme Reference Document, pp.3-4.

<sup>30</sup> [www.southernassembly.ie/eu-programmes/southern-and-eastern-regional-operational-programme-2014-2020](http://www.southernassembly.ie/eu-programmes/southern-and-eastern-regional-operational-programme-2014-2020)

support companies which already have a history of investing in innovation and R&D activity - mostly in-house; is deepening existing links between academia and business in many cases; is serving companies whose main motivations for participation is to help their business to grow and also to access academic knowledge.

### Evaluation Criteria

The table below details the evaluation criteria for the Innovation Partnership Programme. It also includes details of the objectives that the evaluation criteria link to.

**Table 6: Evaluation Criteria for Innovation Partnership Programme<sup>31</sup>**

Evaluation Criteria	Description	Relevant Objectives
<b>Commercial opportunity</b>	Commercial Opportunity - Size of the opportunity and validation of the market	Engage in collaborative research projects with Irish universities and institutes of technology to develop new products and services
<b>Exploitation potential (Economic Impact in Ireland)</b>	Exploitation and Economic Impact - Opportunity for Ireland and route to exploitation	Accelerating the economic and societal return on Ireland's STI investment. The Innovation Partnership Programme remains a key part of this strategy of delivering both direct and indirect economic impacts.
<b>Innovation</b>	Innovation and Technology Development - Level of Innovation and technical Feasibility	Develop new and improved products, processes, services, and generate new knowledge and know-how.
<b>Project team</b>	Project team, Workplan and Management and skills and resources	Developing skill sets, intellectual property and publications
<b>Project Management and Workplan</b>	Project plan and deliverables	Acquisition of new knowledge and skills;
<b>Project Costs</b>	Value for money	The research project must outline how the company will benefit in terms of its growth, the evolution of strategic R&D within the company and the creation of new knowledge that can be used by the company to generate commercial advantage

### Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives

In summary, all of the above evaluation criteria relate to the objectives proposed within this scheme.

## 2.2 Priority 2 - Enhancing access to, and use and quality of ICT

### 2.2.1 National Broadband Plan

#### Objectives

To overcome identified gaps in the provision of high speed broadband services and consequently harness the potential development opportunities afforded by high speed connectivity in terms of growth, competitiveness, entrepreneurship, jobs and social inclusion. Provision of the enabling infrastructure will ensure that the

<sup>31</sup> S&E ROP, pg 43.

benefits of the digital economy will be evenly spread and will allow all citizens and businesses to participate fully in, and maximise the benefits of, a digitally enabled economy and society.<sup>32</sup>

According to the National Broadband Plan, the key objectives of the NBP are as follows:<sup>33</sup>

1. Deliver the intervention as quickly as possible to ensure a national high speed broadband network for Ireland
2. Every home and business to have access to high speed broadband with a choice of service providers
3. Ensure that the network can meet current and future demand
4. Maximise re-use of existing infrastructure
5. Incentivise additional commercial investment
6. Stimulate growth and retention in jobs while enabling e-farming, e-health, trading online, e-education, tourism, savings for consumers etc.

These objectives mean that high quality and reliable broadband services will be provided, value for money will be achieved, and government policy on economic recovery and jobs will be supported.

### **Project Selection Process:**

**Process:** The areas to be targeted for the provision of high speed broadband will be identified in a comprehensive mapping exercise. A broadband service provider(s) will be selected arising from a competitive tender process for the roll out of high speed broadband in the identified target areas<sup>34</sup>.

**Selection Criteria:** The criteria selection of the successful bidder(s) will be specified in the request for tender document.<sup>35</sup>

### **Summary of Project Selection Criteria against Objectives**

A competitive dialogue process is being followed to appoint a contractor. A Procurement Board was set up to oversee and ensure compliance of the process which involves 8 steps<sup>36</sup>: The tender process has been subject to a Procurement Process Review<sup>37</sup>. The review, undertaken by an independent Process Auditor was published and accepted by the government in November 2018<sup>38</sup>. The process auditor reviewed the procurement process and found it to be fair and transparent. The preferred bidder was approved by Government in May 2019.

## **2.3 Priority 3 - Enhancing the competitiveness of SMEs**

### **2.3.1 Entrepreneurship in Micro-Enterprises**

#### **Objectives**

To increase employment levels in micro-enterprises in the S&E Region by supporting business start-ups, business expansion and higher innovation levels in micro-enterprises.

---

<sup>32</sup> S&E ROP 2014-2020, p15.

<sup>33</sup> National Broadband Plan, Connecting Communities: Ireland's Broadband Intervention Strategy, Updated December 2015, p. 15

<sup>34</sup> S&E ROP Scheme Implementation Plan

<sup>35</sup> S&E ROP Scheme Implementation Plan

<sup>36</sup> <https://www.dccae.gov.ie/en-ie/communications/topics/Broadband/national-broadband-plan/state-intervention/Pages/Procurement.aspx>

<sup>37</sup> Mr. Peter Smyth is an independent consultant contracted, following a tender, as Process Auditor in respect of the National Broadband Plan procurement process. Mr. Smyth was asked to prepare a report, by the Taoiseach.

<sup>38</sup> [https://www.dccae.gov.ie/documents/NBP\\_Procurement\\_Process\\_Audit\\_Report\\_23\\_November\\_2018.pdf](https://www.dccae.gov.ie/documents/NBP_Procurement_Process_Audit_Report_23_November_2018.pdf) and [https://merrionstreet.ie/en/News-Room/News/Minister\\_Bruton\\_Publishes\\_Smyth\\_Review.html](https://merrionstreet.ie/en/News-Room/News/Minister_Bruton_Publishes_Smyth_Review.html)

This investment priority will support innovative and growth-oriented SME start-ups and expansions through the provision of business information, advisory services, capacity building, mentoring and financial supports. The financial supports will be targeted at more value added clients in the manufacturing and traded services activities which do not lead to deadweight and or displacement. The non-financial supports are broader and more generally focused, but will meet the specific needs of high growth and potential high-growth Companies<sup>39</sup>

**Evaluation Criteria<sup>40</sup>**

The table below details the evaluation criteria for this scheme. It also includes details of the objectives that the criteria link to.

**Table 7: Evaluation Criteria for Entrepreneurship in Micro-Enterprises**

<b>Evaluation Criteria</b>	<b>Relevant Objective</b>
<b>The quality, commercial viability of the project proposal and its local relevance;</b>	Supporting business start-ups
<b>Overall costs of the project and its cost effectiveness</b>	No relevant objective
<b>The contribution of the proposal to the development of the enterprise in terms of internal capacity</b>	Supporting Business Expansion To increase employment levels in micro-enterprises
<b>Potential for deadweight or displacement</b>	No relevant objective
<b>Potential to increase the competitiveness of the enterprise and added value to local enterprise development</b>	Higher innovation levels in micro-enterprises
<b>Adherence to cross cutting themes</b>	No relevant objective

**Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives**

In summary, the objectives defined under priority 3 align with each of these objectives and are reflected in the content of the evaluation criteria used within its selection process.

**2.4 Priority 4 - Supporting the shift towards a low-carbon economy**

**2.4.1 Social Housing Retrofit<sup>41</sup>**

**Objectives**

The principal objective of the retrofitting proposal is to meet Ireland’s commitments in relation to carbon emissions reductions and energy reduction targets for 2020. Energy savings in buildings will contribute 45% of Ireland’s total energy savings targets for 2020. The energy retrofitting of buildings in the private and public sector hold the greatest potential for energy savings.

<sup>39</sup>S&E ROP, p.2-3.  
<sup>40</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020, P3, pg 1  
<sup>41</sup> [www.southernassembly.ie/eu-programmes/southern-and-eastern-regional-operational-programme-2014-2020](http://www.southernassembly.ie/eu-programmes/southern-and-eastern-regional-operational-programme-2014-2020)

Secondary objectives of the retrofitting proposal include:

- Stimulating employment generation within the construction/energy retrofitting sector. This measure will support some 4167 jobs nationally, taking account of both direct and indirect jobs, over the implementation period;
- Demonstrating the importance of public sector bodies leading by example as required by the Recast Energy Performance of Buildings Directive and the Energy Efficiency Directive.

### Evaluation Criteria<sup>42</sup>

The table below details the evaluation criteria for this scheme. It also includes details of the objectives that the criteria link to.

Table 8: Evaluation Criteria for Social Housing Retrofit

Evaluation Criteria	Relevant Objective
Properties will be selected by the local authorities in consultation with DECLG.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Demonstrating the importance of public sector bodies leading by example as required by the Recast Energy Performance of Buildings Directive and the Energy Efficiency Directive.</li> </ul>
<p>Properties without adequate basic fabric insulation or thermal saving measures as follows</p> <p>Properties which have un-insulated solid walls- pre-1978 dwellings, solid block, hollow block or mass concrete wall; u-Value.2.1.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To meet Ireland's commitments in relation to carbon emissions reductions and energy reduction targets for 2020</li> <li>• Stimulating employment generation within the construction/energy retrofitting sector.</li> <li>• Demonstrating the importance of public sector bodies leading by example as required by the Recast Energy Performance of Buildings Directive and the Energy Efficiency Directive.</li> </ul>
Unit cost, the extent of local housing need and the age/condition of the property	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To meet Ireland's commitments in relation to carbon emissions reductions and energy reduction targets for 2020</li> <li>• Demonstrating the importance of public sector bodies leading by example as required by the Recast Energy Performance of Buildings Directive and the Energy Efficiency Directive.</li> </ul>

### Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives

A summary of the scheme's evaluation criteria shows that all of the content within holds relevance to the objectives proposed.

## 2.4.2 Better Energy Warmer Home Schemes

### Objectives

The objectives of the Scheme are to improve the energy efficiency of the household at risk and in the process reduce the amount of expenditure that is required to be spent on energy.

<sup>42</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020, P4, pg 10



Other secondary objectives are to improve health and well-being, while reducing the amount of disposal income spent on energy. A reduction in spend on energy will also make a positive contribution to **reducing poverty in at-risk households**.

In order to qualify for support under this scheme, the following requirements must be met:

- Applicants must own their home and be living in it.
- Homes must have been built and occupied before 2006.
- Applicants must be receiving **one of the following payments**:
  - Fuel allowance as part of the National Fuel Scheme.
  - Working family payment.
  - Jobseekers Allowance for over 6 months and have a child aged under 7 years.
  - Domiciliary care allowance.
  - One parent family payment
  - Carer’s allowance and live with the person they care for<sup>43</sup>.

### Evaluation Criteria

The table below details the evaluation criteria for this scheme. It also includes details of the objectives that the criteria link to.

Table 9: Evaluation Criteria for Better Energy Warmer Homes

Evaluation Criteria	Relevant Objective
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Applicants must own their home and be living in it.</b></li> </ul>	n/a
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Homes must have been built and occupied before 2006</b></li> </ul>	Improve the energy efficiency of the household at risk
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Applicants must be receiving one of the following payments:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– <b>Fuel allowance as part of the National Fuel Scheme.</b></li> <li>– <b>Working family payment.</b></li> <li>– <b>Jobseekers Allowance for over 6 months and have a child aged under 7 years.</b></li> <li>– <b>Domiciliary care allowance.</b></li> <li>– <b>One parent family payment</b></li> <li>– <b>Carer’s allowance and live with the person they care for</b></li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Make a positive contribution to reducing poverty in at-risk households  Reduce the amount of disposal income spent on energy

### Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives

In summary, the above evaluation criteria contains content that align with all of the defined objectives within the criteria.

<sup>43</sup> [http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/housing/housing\\_grants\\_and\\_schemes/warmer\\_homes\\_scheme.html](http://www.citizensinformation.ie/en/housing/housing_grants_and_schemes/warmer_homes_scheme.html)

## 2.5 Priority 5 - Sustainable Urban Development

### 2.5.1 Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme

#### Objectives

To increase the number of integrated urban regeneration initiatives to improve the urban environment and revitalise urban areas.

#### Evaluation Criteria

Actions will be selected by urban authorities on the basis of a detailed specification and criteria to be prepared for the investment programme. These criteria will take account of, inter alia, the following key criteria shown in the table below. The table also includes details of the objectives that the criteria link to

Table 10: Evaluation Criteria for Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme

Criteria	Relevant Objective
<b>Coherence with the integrated strategy submitted, including the strategic fit with national, regional and local plans, national GHG reduction strategies and individual Urban Centre Strategies.</b>	To support low carbon sustainable, multimodal urban mobility in designated urban centres.
<b>Quality of the selected proposal(s) in terms of social inclusion and contribution to economic development of urban centre, universal design and environmental sustainability,</b>	To revitalise, regenerate and improve the urban environment in the designated urban centres as part of integrated urban strategies.
<b>Social and Economic benefits that the proposal will bring to the community and to the urban centre concerned over-and-above what is there already in terms of employment and sustainable economic development.</b>	To revitalise, regenerate and improve the urban environment in the designated urban centres as part of integrated urban strategies
<b>Value for money of the proposed actions to be supported and the expected leverage effect of additional public and private funding</b>	n/a
<b>Inclusiveness of the consultative process undertaken in the development of the integrated strategy and the prioritization of project actions, in terms of council and community buy-in.</b>	n/a
<b>Delivery arrangement including project management arrangements, milestones, targets, deadlines and outcomes.</b>	n/a

#### Summary of Evaluation Criteria against Objectives

Overall, evaluation criteria used within this scheme contain a number of objective-related content. All of the two primary objectives align with 50% of the criteria, suggesting that a satisfaction of this criteria should hold importance in facilitating the achievement of the primary objectives.

## 2.5.2 Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme – Details of Planned Developments and Relevance to Priority

The table below details selected planned developments and how they relate to the objectives of the priority.

**Table 11: Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme**

Planned Development	Description	Relevance to objectives of priority
<b>Dublin Gateway<sup>44</sup></b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Dun Laoghaire-Rathdown (DLR) project will involve the regeneration of the bath pavilion, to accommodate studio space for artists, and to provide a gallery and café facilities.</li> <li>There is planned the creation of pedestrian and cycle routes through the pavilion to town centre with a new pedestrian route to connect the walkway at Newtownsmith with the East Pier</li> <li>The South Dublin project will involve works on the Dodder Valley Greenway. The Greenway is a strategic route in the National Transport Agency Greater Dublin Area cycle network Plan, which is planned to run from Dublin Docklands to the Dublin Mountains.</li> <li>The Fingal project will see investment in the Swords Castle Cultural and Civic Quarter involving alterations and improvements to the castle to make it more accessible as both a heritage tourist attraction and public amenity.</li> </ul>	Aims to improve the urban environment in the designated urban centres, by providing of pedestrian and cycle routes and the regeneration of the bath pavilion.
<b>Cork Gateway &amp; Mallow Hub<sup>45</sup></b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Gateway city of Cork will divide their funding between two projects.</li> <li>The development of the Marina Park area to provide a contemporary City Park with a focus on water based activities, play and a range of event spaces.</li> <li>The provision of a dedicated cycle and pedestrian bridge across the North Channel of the River Lee linking Merchants Quay to Harley Street</li> <li>In addition, the Mallow project aims to redevelop the town hall as an Arts &amp; Cultural Centre. The centre will retain the existing tourism office and will provide facilities such as a café, studio/workshop space and youth bank facility.</li> </ul>	Aims to improve the urban environment in the designated urban centres, by developing the Marina Park area and with the provision of a dedicated cycle and pedestrian bridge.
<b>Waterford Gateway<sup>46</sup></b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Aims to improve access and encourage the proposed new retail shopping initiative at the southern end of the retail spine to improve the city's retail offer.</li> </ul>	Aims to improve the urban environment and provide a comprehensive sustainable urban mobility plan, which gives priority to sustainable modes of transport.

<sup>44</sup> [http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/DUCGS\\_DRA.pdf](http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/DUCGS_DRA.pdf)

<sup>45</sup> [http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Cork\\_DUCGS.pdf](http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Cork_DUCGS.pdf)

<sup>46</sup> [www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Waterford\\_DUCGS.pdf](http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Waterford_DUCGS.pdf)

Planned Development	Description	Relevance to objectives of priority
<b>Limerick-Shannon Gateway</b> <sup>47</sup>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Shannon project consists of the redesign of an existing space called Rineanna Park by incorporating circulation footpaths linking the town centre to the schools and community facilities to the South and to the estuary walks.</li> </ul>	Supporting the non-private car commuting levels in the designated urban centres
<b>Killarney Tralee Hub</b> <sup>48</sup>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The development of a central site as a public park and for the adjoining streets to be upgraded to enhance the linkages to the rest of the town centre.</li> </ul>	Aims to support, revitalise, regenerate and improve the urban environment
<b>Ennis Hub</b> <sup>49</sup>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The hub town of Ennis plan to construct a new county library which will replace the existing 1975 construction thought to have outgrown its capacity to function as a modern library. It is envisaged that this new building will incorporate 3 separate library services in the one building</li> </ul>	Aims to support, revitalise, regenerate and improve the urban environment
<b>Kilkenny Hub</b> <sup>50</sup>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The creation of a new Riverside Garden providing access to the River Nore and National Monuments. Movement of pedestrians and cyclists will be prioritised through the site. The project involves the development of public realm including a civic space in front of the Mayfair building, a landscaped courtyard adjoining the site and the redevelopment of Horse Barrack Lane.</li> </ul>	Improve the urban environment
<b>Wexford Hub</b> <sup>51</sup>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Wexford Hub town project will involve the regeneration of the Crescent Quay focusing on the area from Crescent Quay to Trinity Wharf.</li> </ul>	Aims to improve the economic vitality, ease transport and facilitate pedestrianisation.

<sup>47</sup> [www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/LimShan\\_DUCGS.pdf](http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/LimShan_DUCGS.pdf)

<sup>48</sup> [http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Tralee\\_DUCGS1.pdf](http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Tralee_DUCGS1.pdf)

<sup>49</sup> [http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Ennis\\_DUCGS.pdf](http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Ennis_DUCGS.pdf)

<sup>50</sup> [www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Kilkenny\\_DUCGS.pdf](http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Kilkenny_DUCGS.pdf)

<sup>51</sup> [http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Wexford\\_DUCGS4.pdf](http://www.southernassembly.ie/uploads/general-files/Wexford_DUCGS4.pdf)

### 3. APPENDIX 4C: PROJECT SELECTION - EXTENT TO WHICH PROJECT SELECTION PROCESS IS COMPETITIVE IN NATURE

This section assesses the extent to which project selection processes are competitive in nature. This is presented for all schemes by priority.

#### 3.1 Priority 1 - Strengthening Research, Technology Development and Innovation

##### 3.1.1 SFI Research Centres Programme<sup>52</sup>

###### Process

There are open calls run for researchers in eligible Research Bodies, which generally have fixed deadlines.

All submissions are subjected to competitive, international merit review processes carried out by a panel of leading experts who make recommendations to SFI Executive, or SFI Board as appropriate, who make the final decision on awards.

###### Competitiveness of Proposals

Proposals that can demonstrate industry **cost-share contributions above** the specified levels may be viewed as delivering a greater economic impact to Ireland and hence this may **make the proposals more competitive**<sup>53</sup>.

The Research Centres Programme follow three stages: pre-proposal stage, full proposal stage, and impact panel presentation stage.

###### Awards

There have been 16 Spokes awards made to Research Bodies based in the S&E region during the lifetime of the programme up to 2017. Furthermore, up to 2017 four Research Centres CONNECT, ADAPT, LERO and iCRAG with a total SFI award value of €93m (direct cost budget) and €77m payroll costs only, have been co-financed by the ROP 2014-20.

The duration of the Research Centres are for a period of 6 years. All awards of this timescale follow a similar lifecycle from an initial ramp up phase through to being substantially complete in the final months of the award. As at December 2017 the four research Centres awards included in this report are fully operational. In addition, 4 new Research Centres were awarded in late 2017 in the S&E region. There is only minimal expenditure incurred on these new RC in 2017 but the expenditure will ramp up in 2018. The details of the 4 new Research Centres are as follows: The duration of the Awards are 6 years so the Research Centres will continue until August 2023.

**Table 12: SFI Research Centre Funding**

Research Centre	Lead Research Body	Total Direct Costs €	Total payroll budget €
Bioeconomy Research Centre (BEACON)	University College Dublin	11,752,991	8,285,630

<sup>52</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 (August 2018), P1, pg 11

<sup>53</sup> <http://www.sfi.ie/funding/funding-calls/sfi-research-centres/24-research-centres-faqs-2016.pdf>

Research Centre	Lead Research Body	Total Direct Costs €	Total payroll budget €
<b>FutureNeuro</b>	Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland	7,982,727	5,262,175
<b>Confirm Centre for Smart Manufacturing</b>	University of Limerick	24,878,586	20,047,036
<b>I-Form Advanced Manufacturing Research Centre</b>	University College Dublin	12,248,401	8,975,932
<b>Total investment from Sept 2018 – Aug 2023</b>	56,862,705	42,570,773	
<b>Approx. investment for period 2018-2020</b>	28,000,000	20,000,000	

### 3.1.2 SFI Spokes Programme<sup>54</sup>

#### Process

Applications to the Spokes programme must be made by the relevant SFI Research Centre Director, i.e. from an eligible academic Research Body. All submissions are subjected to competitive, international merit review processes carried out by a panel of experts who make recommendations to SFI Executive, or SFI Board as appropriate, who make the final decision on awards. In addition to the requirement for scientific excellence, applications considered under the Spokes programme must clearly demonstrate the value of the research to the expansion, development and sustainability of the SFI Research Centre and the potential for economic and societal impact to Ireland. There are two programmes, the Spokes Fixed Programme, and the Spokes Rolling Programme.

#### Competitiveness of Project Selection System

To obtain funding, applications must first pass the postal review stage (an overview of title and abstract - max. 200 words), involving peer evaluation and review by SFI officers. Second, they must pass a panel review process in the full proposal stage.

### 3.1.3 Marine Research Programme<sup>55</sup>

#### Competitiveness of Project Selection System

Marine Research funding will be administered via competitive calls for proposals from both the research community and industry. Research proposals are evaluated by a panel of national and international experts maintained by the Marine Institute and drawn from third-level, public and industry sectors.

### 3.1.4 Commercialisation Fund<sup>56</sup>

#### Selection Process / Competitiveness of Project Selection System

Projects are assessed for their commercial merit and technical merit by internal, and in some cases external, reviewers and panels which may include external experts. The criteria considered by reviewers in assessing

<sup>54</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 (August 2018), P1, pg 1

<sup>55</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 (August 2018), P1, pg 31

<sup>56</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 (August 2018), P1, pg 22

proposals include commercial opportunity, economic potential, innovation and technology development, project team/management/workplan, and project costs.<sup>57</sup>

According to Enterprise Ireland<sup>58</sup>:

- In 2014 and 2015, the Commercialisation Fund programme provided 2 funding supports to researchers 1) Commercial Case Feasibility (CFF) support a preparatory award, to help researchers to scope the commercial case for the innovation or project idea 2) Commercialisation Fund (CF) Support- support to develop the innovation for commercialisation.
- In 2014 and 2015, **open calls** were operated for CFF project applications while applications for CF support were received through **two published calls**, the 1st calls closed in February and the 2nd calls closed in July 2014 and 2015. In 2015, the application submission process for CF Project Support applications moved to an **on-line system**. In addition to the published calls, **an invited proposal system** was operated for CF support projects.

EI also noted that universities have tended to be more adept than other applicants at applying for and gaining funding for the Commercialisation Fund and Innovation Partnerships.<sup>59</sup>

### 3.1.5 Innovation Partnership Programme<sup>60</sup>

#### Selection Process

There are two phases associated with an Innovation Partnership application. In Phase 1, either an Outline Proposal Document or an Innovation Partnership Feasibility Study application can be submitted. Phase 2 is a Full Application. Full Proposal Applications are accepted following the approval of an outline proposal or following the submission of a report upon completion of an Innovation Partnership Feasibility Study. The company must discuss this proposal in detail with their Development Adviser / Agency Contact before the research institute partner submits it. After Technical and Commercial Assessment, the project is brought to Enterprise Ireland's Industrial Research & Commercialisation Committee for decision.

Funding levels also vary based on type of research (industrial collaborative research or experimental collaborative research) and company size (small, medium or large)<sup>61</sup>.

#### Competitiveness of Project Selection System

EI noted that universities have tended to be more adept than other applicants at applying for and gaining funding for the Commercialisation Fund and Innovation Partnerships.<sup>62</sup>

## 3.2 Priority 2 - Enhancing access to, and use and quality of ICT

### 3.2.1 National Broadband Plan<sup>63</sup>

Overall, the National Broadband Plan involves commercial telecoms firms investing approximately 2.6 billion euro up to the end of 2016 to connect high-speed broadband to 70% of premises, with the state intervening in areas of market failure to ensure coverage to the remaining 30%.

#### Project Selection Process

A broadband service provider(s) will be selected through a **competitive tender process** for the roll out of high speed broadband in the identified target areas.

#### Selection Criteria

---

<sup>57</sup> Commercialisation Fund Programme, Reference Document, pg.3.

<sup>58</sup> SEROP Monitoring Committee meeting notes, 10 May 2016, p.2.

<sup>59</sup> SEROP Monitoring Committee meeting notes, 8 June 2017, p.2.

<sup>60</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 (August 2018), P1, pg 25

<sup>61</sup> EI Innovation Partnership Programme Guidelines 2018, p. 6.

<sup>62</sup> SEROP Monitoring Committee meeting notes, 8 June 2017, p.2.

<sup>63</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 (August 2018), P2, pg 1



The selection criteria for the successful bidder(s) will be specified in the request for tender document.

### **Competitiveness of Project Selection System**

In terms of progress to date, a competitive dialogue process is being followed to appoint a contractor. A Procurement Board was set up to oversee and ensure compliance of the process which involves the following steps<sup>64</sup>:

- Step 1: Pre-qualification Questionnaire (PQQ) - Closed on 31 March 2016
- Step 2: Evaluation of the responses received to the PQQ - Concluded 05 July 2016
- Step 3: Invitation to Participate in Dialogue (ITPD) - Issued to three bidders in July 2016 and dialogue commenced
- Step 4: Invitation to Submit Detailed Solutions (ISDS) - Issued in June 2017. Bidders submitted Detailed Solutions for assessment in September 2017. This is followed by a final stage of dialogue
- Step 5: Submission of final tenders
- Step 6: Evaluation of final tender
- Step 7: Pending compliant bid and Government decision, preferred bidder identified
- Step 8: If preferred bidder is approved, contract awarded

The purpose of the intensive dialogue process is to tease through very detailed specifications and to trouble shoot issues arising, to deliver a robust and fit-for-purpose contract and network. As part of this formal procurement process, the Project Information Memorandum (PIM), Project Information Notice (PIN), the Pre-Qualification Questionnaire (PQQ), Invitation to Participate in Dialogue (ITPD), Invitation to Participate in Detailed Solutions (IPDS) were all publically advertised (displaying the ERDF logo)<sup>65</sup>.

## **3.3 Priority 3 - Enhancing the competitiveness of SMEs**

### **3.3.1 Entrepreneurship in Micro-Enterprise<sup>66</sup>**

#### **Competitiveness of Project Selection System**

The selection process involves approval of micro-enterprise, and a systematic appraisal of all project proposals by assessing the quality, commercial viability of the project proposal and its local relevance. The micro-enterprise support actions will be administered in each local authority area by the relevant Local Enterprise Office. Each Local Enterprise Office will operate in accordance with a Service Level Agreement with Enterprise Ireland setting out the protocols relating to service delivery, operational arrangements, policy and support, budgets and performance metrics. Approval of micro-enterprise support will be affected through the relevant Local Enterprise Office operating within local authorities. The allocations are subject to final approval by the Board of Enterprise Ireland, following which a budget letter is issued to the local authority.

This scheme has two elements: Start-Your-Own-Business Programmes and the Ireland's Best Young Entrepreneur support scheme.

## **3.4 Priority 4 - Supporting the shift towards a low-carbon economy**

### **3.4.1 Social Housing Retrofit<sup>67</sup>**

This programme includes Measure 1: Insulation Retrofitting Programme, and Measure 2: Retrofitting of Vacant Social Housing Stock.

#### **Competitiveness of Project Selection System**

---

<sup>64</sup> <https://www.dccae.gov.ie/en-ie/communications/topics/Broadband/national-broadband-plan/state-intervention/Pages/Procurement.aspx>

<sup>65</sup> IB report for 2017

<sup>66</sup> Implementation Plans, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 (August 2018), P3, pg 1 & 4-5

<sup>67</sup> Scheme Implementation Plan, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 March 2015



Properties will be selected by the local authorities on the basis of unit cost, the extent of local housing need and the age/condition of the property.

### **3.4.2 Better Energy Warmer Homes Scheme<sup>68</sup>**

Households are individually surveyed to assess what measures are appropriate and needed. Applications are then batched, generally on a geographical basis and allocated to individual contractors. Following completion of works, SEAI undertakes a Building Energy Rating of the dwelling. Contractors are paid once SEAI receives appropriate confirmations that the works are done and pass the relevant audit and quality controls.

The IB reported that the Better Energy Warmer Homes Scheme is incredibly popular with increasing levels of enquiries being received from potential recipients. Applications to the scheme are based on applicants receiving: Fuel Allowance as part of the National Fuel Scheme, Job Seekers Allowance for over six months, Working Family Payments, One Parent Family Payments and Domiciliary Care Allowance. It was recognised that the scheme has the potential to benefit a wider range of potential beneficiaries (i.e. a wider base of social benefits recipients) and implement 'deeper measures' through more comprehensive packages of interventions to increase impact and outputs.

## **3.5 Priority 5 - Sustainable Urban Development**

### **3.5.1 Designated Urban Centres Grant Scheme**

#### **Competitiveness of Project Selection System**

In the 'Sustainable Urban Development' scheme within Priority 5, an open call was made to all local authorities to submit a proposal. Out of this, 16 projects were identified across the region.

---

<sup>68</sup> Scheme Implementation Plan, S&E Regional Operational Programme 2014 – 2020 (June 2017)

## rsmuk.com

The UK group of companies and LLPs trading as RSM is a member of the RSM network. RSM is the trading name used by the members of the RSM network. Each member of the RSM network is an independent accounting and consulting firm each of which practises in its own right. The RSM network is not itself a separate legal entity of any description in any jurisdiction. The RSM network is administered by RSM International Limited, a company registered in England and Wales (company number 4040598) whose registered office is at 50 Cannon Street, London EC4N 6JJ. The brand and trademark RSM and other intellectual property rights used by members of the network are owned by RSM International Association, an association governed by article 60 et seq of the Civil Code of Switzerland whose seat is in Zug.

RSM Corporate Finance LLP, RSM Restructuring Advisory LLP, RSM Risk Assurance Services LLP, RSM Tax and Advisory Services LLP, RSM UK Audit LLP, RSM UK Consulting LLP, RSM Employer Services Limited, RSM Northern Ireland (UK) Limited and RSM UK Tax and Accounting Limited are not authorised under the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 but we are able in certain circumstances to offer a limited range of investment services because we are members of the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales. We can provide these investment services if they are an incidental part of the professional services we have been engaged to provide. RSM Legal LLP is authorised and regulated by the Solicitors Regulation Authority, reference number 626317, to undertake reserved and non-reserved legal activities. It is not authorised under the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000 but is able in certain circumstances to offer a limited range of investment services because it is authorised and regulated by the Solicitors Regulation Authority and may provide investment services if they are an incidental part of the professional services that it has been engaged to provide. Baker Tilly Creditor Services LLP is authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority for credit-related regulated activities. RSM & Co (UK) Limited is authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority to conduct a range of investment business activities. Before accepting an engagement, contact with the existing accountant will be made to request information on any matters of which, in the existing accountant's opinion, the firm needs to be aware before deciding whether to accept the engagement.